

MEMO

DATE: October 26, 2023

TO: Historic Preservation Commission

FROM: Millisa Smith, Assistant Planner, Development Services – Planning

SUBJECT: 306 2nd Street, Project No.: HP-23-0007, Addendum to Staff Report

At the regular October 4, 2023, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka, the proposed siding and window rehabilitation project at 306 2nd Street, known as the Metropole building, was heard at a second noticed public hearing. After due consideration of the submitted project, the Commission continued the project, for a second time, to the next regular scheduled meeting, on Wednesday, November 1, 2023, in order to provide the applicant time to address additional requests.

At the October 4, 2023, meeting the applicant proposed to utilize the Hardie Panel Artisan Line for siding, which was suggested by Commissioners at the September 6, 2023 meeting. The applicant had also obtained a quote from one local contractor, Floyd Cunha of Cunha Creations, for wooden windows, but indicated, due to numerous factors, including the substantial cost difference between replacement wooden windows and the proposed Milgard windows, the long-term durability of the proposed windows, the manufacturer's warranty, the time-frame associated with replacing the windows in-kind, and the reluctance of contractors to accept the job of replacing the windows in-kind, the applicant continued to propose to replace the windows as presented in the Staff Report (Attachment 9) and felt due diligence had been done in exploring alternative options.

The Commission requested the applicant explore other options for the siding, windows, and window framing, other than those presented in the Staff Report and at the second public hearing, by contacting contractors listed on the Historic Preservation Resource List and the Historic Preservation Wooden Window Resource List. The Commission requested the applicant obtain quotes for siding, windows and window trim milled to match the existing in both materials and dimensions. Specific local resources mentioned by Commissioners include:

- Blue Ox Millworks
- C.J.'s Sash and Door
- Daniel Jones with Humboldt Bay Window and Door
- Mad River Woodworks
- Valley Lumber and Millwork

The applicant contacted all of the companies listed above and received responses and quotes from Blue Ox Millworks (Attachment 2), Mad River Woodworks (Attachment 3) and Valley Lumber and Millwork (Attachment 4). The applicant additionally contacted Schmidbauer Building Supply to obtain written quotes for materials previously proposed, including Hardie Panel and Cedar siding (Attachment 5).

- **Blue Ox Millworks.** Blue Ox Millworks quoted \$3,500 per window for windows designed to match the originals, including a bottom sash. For ten windows the total of materials, before tax and without installation, would be \$35,000.
- **Mad River Woodworks.** Mad River Woodworks quoted \$1,900 per window for custom windows, comprised of old growth Redwood and/or Yellow Cedar, designed to match. For ten windows the total of materials, before tax and not including delivery or installation, would be \$19,000.

Mad River Woodworks also provided a quote for two different siding options, old growth Redwood and second growth Redwood. It was estimated the project would require 2,808 linear feet of siding. Old growth Redwood would be \$13.90 per linear foot and would total \$39,031.20, not including tax, delivery, or installation. New growth Redwood would be \$7.60 per linear foot and would total \$21,340.80.

Total cost of materials alone for in-kind replacement for windows and siding by Mad River Woodworks would range from \$40,340.80 to \$58,031.20.

- **Valley Lumber and Millwork.** Valley Lumber and Millwork provided a quote for three different siding options. 1) "One-inch by 10-inch finger jointed Cedar" which would be \$5.14 a linear foot, totaling approximately \$14,433.12 in materials. 2) "one-inch by 10-inch heart B grade second or third growth Redwood" which would be \$9.14 per linear foot, totaling approximately \$25,665.12 in materials. 3) "one-inch by eight-inch Hardie V groove" which would be \$55.39 for a 12-foot section, or approximately \$4.61 per linear foot, totaling approximately \$12,944.88 in materials.
- **Schmidbauer Building Supply.** Schmidbauer Building Supply provided an invoice for the already purchased Milgard brand Tuscan series windows proposed by the applicant and presented in the Staff Report showing total cost for the proposed vinyl windows being \$4,729.32.

Schmidbauer building supply provided three different siding options. 1) a one-inch by eight-inch finger-jointed Cedar siding; the quote totaled \$13,613.46 including tax but not installation. 2) one-inch by 8-inch Pine siding; the quote totaled \$8,958.09 including tax but not installation. 3) Hardie brand V groove Artisan Line siding; the quote totaled \$9,166.96 including tax but not installation.

- **Cunha Creations.** As discussed in the September 27, 2023, Addendum Memo to the Staff Report (Attachment 8), the applicant previously contacted Floyd Cunha with Cunha Creations for a quote for wooden windows. Cunha Creations indicated wooden windows would range from \$1,200 to \$2,000 for materials alone, totaling \$12,000-

Memorandum
Metropole Siding and Window Rehabilitation, 306 2nd Street, APN 001-093-016
October 26, 2023

Page 3

\$20,000 for 10 windows, not including tax or installation. This contractor also expressed they would not be interested in performing the work.

The applicant has expressed the importance that the cost of installation has not been included on any of the quotes, which, in their opinion, and due to the height of the wall, would more than likely double the cost of the project, which contributes substantially to why keeping the cost of materials as low as possible is imperative to the successful completion of this project.

A representative of Valley Lumber further expressed that Hardie only produces V groove siding for the Artisan line, and that Hardie discontinued the bevel channel in the Artisan line in 2021. This representative further expressed the next closest option is finger jointed Cedar, which is prone to failure.

A representative from Blue Ox Millworks expressed to the applicant that although quotes could be provided for old growth Redwood, old growth Redwood is only available when a tree has fallen, at which time it could be harvested. Local lumber suppliers have no control over the supply of old growth Redwood, which can drastically affect the timeline of a project if this is the desired/required material.

It is important to note that if an applicant proposes to replace an element of a historic building's façade in the same exact configuration and same exact materials, this would be in-kind repairs and the project would not need to come before the Historic Preservation Commission for approval. If the applicant proposed in-kind repairs Staff would no longer bring the project before the HPC and would refund the application fee to the applicant.

As indicated in the applicant's submitted comment letter (Attachment 6) they are proposing to replace the existing rotted and deteriorating siding with V groove Artisan line Hardie brand siding, outlined above under the Schmidbauer Building Supply quote, and the Milgard Tuscan series windows, as detailed in the original Staff Report. As outlined in the applicant's comment letter, due to their current financial state, coupled with the fact that other materials are either not available or far beyond what they can afford, in-kind repairs are not possible.

Conclusion:

With the modification of the siding material, the due diligence exhibited by the applicant to explore alternate options suggested by the Commission, and the findings presented in the Staff Report, Staff finds that replacement of windows and siding with different materials is appropriate in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation and the recommendations made by the Commission. The essential form and integrity of the historic property will be visually unimpaired, with proposed materials matching the old materials almost exactly in design, color, and texture; and, as conditioned, any windows or sections of siding which are repairable or not severely deteriorated will be retained for repairs on other more prominent façades of the building.

Attachment I: Revised Historic Preservation Commission Resolution (in track changes)

Memorandum
Metropole Siding and Window Rehabilitation, 306 2nd Street, APN 001-093-016
October 26, 2023

Page 4

Attachment 2: Blue Ox Millworks quote

Attachment 3: Mad River Woodworks quote

Attachment 4: Valley Lumber and Millwork quote

Attachment 5: Schmidbauer Building Supply quote

Attachment 6: Comment letter from Applicant for November 1, 2023 HPC meeting

Attachment 7: Comment letter from Applicant for October 4, 2023 HPC meeting

Attachment 8: Addendum Memo from October 4, 2023 HPC meeting

Attachment 9: Staff Report