

MEMO

DATE: September 27, 2023

TO: Historic Preservation Commission

FROM: Millisa Smith, Assistant Planner, Development Services – Planning

SUBJECT: 306 2nd Street, Project No.: HP-23-0007, Addendum to Staff Report

At the regular September 6, 2023 meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka, the proposed siding and window rehabilitation project at 306 2nd Street, known as the Metropole building, was heard at a noticed public hearing. After due consideration of the submitted project, the Commission continued the project to the next regular scheduled meeting, on Wednesday October 4, 2023, in order to provide the applicant time to address their requests.

The Commission requested the applicant explore other options for the siding, windows, and window framing, other than those presented in the Staff Report, by contacting both local and out of area contractors for quotes.

Options the Commission suggestions include:

- Utilizing the Hardie Panel Artisan Line for siding;
- Contacting Truitt and White Lumber and Hardware out of Berkley, CA for a quote for siding and window framing milled to match the existing; and
- Restoring existing wood windows where possible or replacing with new wood windows from a local contractor.

Per the Commission's recommendation, the applicant has elected to utilize the Hardie Panel Artisan Line for the proposed siding replacement along the entire south-facing building façade; and, Schmidbauer, a local building supply company, has this product available for purchase. The applicant contacted Truitt and White Lumbar Company (Berkley, CA) for a quote for milled Redwood to match the existing siding and window framing, per the Commission's recommendation, was then referred to their website to obtain a quote, and the website allows only licensed contractors with an established account to receive quotes. This, coupled with the fact that the Hardie Panel Artisan Line is readily available locally and far more cost effective, led the applicant to opt for the Hardie Panel Artisan Line, as suggested by the Commission.

The applicant also contacted a local contractor, Floyd Cunha from Cunha Creations, and discussed cost and time-frame estimates for restoring the existing deteriorated wooden windows. The applicant has indicated Cunha Creations estimated each window would cost \$1,200-\$2,000 per window. Additionally, Cunha Creations indicated each window would take approximately two to three weeks to repair and expressed they were not interested in taking

Memorandum
Metropole Siding and Window Rehabilitation, 306 2nd Street, APN 001-093-016
September 27, 2023

Page 2

the job. Per the applicant, the estimated costs and time-frame for replacing the windows in-kind, coupled with the fact that finding a contractor to agree to the project is proving difficult, makes in-kind replacement infeasible. Therefore, the applicant wishes to replace the 10 south-facing wood windows with Milgard Tuscan Line double-hung windows of the same exact dimensions as the existing windows, as presented in the Staff Report. Since the September 6, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting the applicant has discussed both cost and durability of the proposed windows with agents of the manufacturer Milgard and Schmidbauer Building Supply. It was indicated by Milgard and Schmidbauer that the proposed windows come with a 10-year warranty and rarely fail. If one of the proposed windows needed to be repaired or replaced the cost is estimated between \$120-\$400.

Due to the substantial cost difference between replacement wooden windows and the proposed Milgard windows, the long-term durability of the proposed windows, the manufacturer's warranty, the time-frame associated with replacing the windows in-kind, and the reluctance of contractors to accept the job of replacing the windows in-kind, the applicant is proposing to replace the windows as proposed in the Staff Report and feels due diligence has been done in exploring alternative options.

The applicant has now proposed that upon removal of the existing deteriorated wooden windows, they will store and repair any windows which are not severely damaged. Any windows which can be salvaged and repaired will be retained for future window replacements on other façades of the building (2nd Street or D Street), and a condition has been added requiring such.

Conclusion:

With the modification of the siding material, the due diligence exhibited by the applicant to explore alternate options suggested by the Commission, and the findings presented in the Staff Report, Staff finds that replacement of windows and siding with different materials is appropriate in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation and the recommendations made by the Commission. The essential form and integrity of the historic property will be visually unimpaired, with proposed materials matching the old materials almost exactly in design, color, and texture; and, as conditioned due to the applicant's new proposal, any windows or sections of siding which are repairable or not severely deteriorated will be retained for repairs on other more prominent façades of the building.

Attachment 1: Revised Historic Preservation Commission Resolution (in track changes)

Attachment 2: Comment Letter from Applicant