

[Note: Bolded text in square brackets indicate placeholders that will be finalized based on the City Council's action on the appeal if they choose to modify.]

CITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION NO. 2026-XX

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF EUREKA MODIFYING THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION'S CONDITIONAL APPROVAL OF THE STARTARE RESIDENTIAL REHABILITATION AND FAÇADE ALTERATIONS AT 1627 PINE STREET (APN: 004-071-015)

WHEREAS, the Applicant (and property owner), William Startare, applied for after-the-fact authorization for the repair, replacement, and alteration of multiple exterior components of the residence at 1627 Pine Street, including, but not limited to new windows, fascia, trim, entryways and landings, installation of Hardie lap siding, lighting fixtures, door hardware, new HVAC vents and plumbing, and the removal of multiple window and door openings (the alterations) under Historic Preservation Project No. HP-25-11; and

WHEREAS, the subject property is listed on the Local Register of Historic Places and includes a residential structure that, according to the Humboldt County Assessor's Office, was converted to a two-unit residence in 1961; and

WHEREAS, according to the "Green Book," the residence was constructed around 1900 and is described as a two-story frame Eastlake house with pedimented two-story square bay; and

WHEREAS, the Sanborn Insurance Map from 1900 confirms the original two-story residence location and footprint on the parcel; and

WHEREAS, the after-the-fact alterations required Historic Preservation Commission Review (Project No. HP-25-11); and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka held a duly noticed public hearing at City Hall in the City of Eureka on June 3, 2026 at 4:00 p.m. in the Council Chamber, and after due consideration of all testimony, evidence, and reports offered, added new Conditions C, D, and E, and voted with a 3-1 majority, with two Commissioners absent, to conditionally approve the alterations, and directed staff to return with written findings and a resolution reflecting that action for adoption at a subsequent meeting; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka held a regularly scheduled meeting on July 1, 2026 to memorialize the Commission's prior action and, with a 6-0 unanimous vote, and no Commissioners absent, adopted Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 2026-3; and

WHEREAS, the conditions of approval adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission in Resolution No. 2026-3, and now before the City Council for review on the appeal, are as follows:

- A. **Compliance with Approved Plans.** The Applicant shall undertake the project as approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. Any deviation in design, architectural style, or exterior appearance from those currently proposed and conditioned shall have prior approval.
- B. **Outdoor Lighting:** All exterior/outdoor lighting fixtures must comply with EMC §155.308.050 (Outdoor Lighting), which requires lighting to be dark sky compliant, and shielded and directed down to avoid light trespass on neighboring properties, nearby wildlife habitat, and the public right-of-way to the maximum extent possible.
- C. **Removal and Replacement of Hardie Siding.** Remove non-historic Hardie lap siding installed in locations where historic wood siding existed, and replace with wood siding matching the historic material, dimensions, and profile (like-for-like).
- D. **Re-establishment of Window Openings.** Reestablish windows in historic window openings that were removed or infilled as part of the unpermitted work, so that the original number and location of openings is restored.
- E. **Future Exterior Changes.** Any future exterior changes needed to meet building code requirements (including changes to window size/type for egress, additional openings, or other modifications) shall require a modification to this permit and return to the Historic Preservation Commission for review and approval prior to construction; and

WHEREAS, actions by the Historic Preservation Commission may be appealed to the City Council by any aggrieved person within 10 calendar days of the decision, which occurred on June 3, 2026; and

WHEREAS, the Applicant filed an appeal within the 10-day appeal period, contesting Conditions C and D and requesting approval to retain the Hardie lap siding and existing window configuration/openings as completed; and

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Eureka held a duly noticed public hearing at City Hall in the City of Eureka on August 4, 2026, at 6:00 p.m. via Zoom and in person in the Council Chamber; and

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Eureka has reviewed the action of the Historic Preservation Commission, and after due consideration of all testimony, evidence, and reports offered at the public hearing, does hereby find and determine the following facts:

- 1. The City Council has considered the appeal filed by the Applicant, including the Applicant's objections to Conditions C and D of Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 2026-3.
- 2. The City Council finds that the project, as modified by this resolution, remains consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, including Standards 2, 4, 5, 6, and 9, because **[insert Council findings supporting the modified conditions]**.

3. The City Council finds that the project, as modified by the Council, remains consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource. Therefore, the project is categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to CEQA Guidelines §15331, Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation (Class 31) **[Note: If the Council cannot find that the modified project remains consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, it cannot rely on the Class 31 exemption. The Council should either revise the modification so the project remains consistent with the Standards or affirm the Commission's conditional approval and deny the appeal.]**

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the City Council of the City of Eureka does hereby grant the appeal in part and modifies the Historic Preservation Commission's conditional approval of Historic Preservation Permit HP-25-11 for the Startare Residential Rehabilitation and Façade Alterations at 1627 Pine Street, as follows:

1. Conditions A, B, and E adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission in Resolution No. 2026-3 and described above are retained and remain in full force and effect.
2. Conditions C and/or D are modified as follows: **[insert modified condition language].**

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED by the City Council of the City of Eureka in the County of Humboldt, State of California, on the 4th day of August 2026, by the following vote:

AYES: COUNCILMEMBERS
NOES: COUNCILMEMBERS
ABSENT: COUNCILMEMBERS
ABSTAIN: COUNCILMEMBERS

Kim Bergel, Mayor of the City of Eureka

Attest:

Pamela J. Powell, City Clerk

Approved as to Administration:

Miles Slattery, City Manager

Approved as to form:

Robert Black, City Attorney